

EXHIBIT C

Kimberly Kenton, M.D.

1 IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
 2 SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF WEST VIRGINIA AT CHARLESTON

3 -----) Master File No.
 IN RE: ETHICON, INC.,) 2:12-MD-02327
 4 PELVIC REPAIR SYSTEM)
 PRODUCTS LIABILITY) MDL 2327
 5 LITIGATION)
 -----) JOSEPH R. GOODWIN
 6) U.S. DISTRICT JUDGE
 THIS DOCUMENT RELATES TO)
 7 PLAINTIFFS:)
)
 8 Christine Wiltgen)
 Case No. 2:12-cv-01216)
 9)
 Laura Waynick)
 10 Case No. 2:12-cv-01151)
)
 11 Denise Burkhardt)
 Case No. 2:12-cv-01023)
 12)
 Debra A. and Donald)
 13 Schnering)
 Case No. 2:12-cv-01071)
 14)
 Karen Bollinger)
 15 Case No. 2:12-cv-01215)
 -----)

16
 17 GENERAL DEPOSITION OF
 18 KIMBERLY KENTON, M.D.
 19 March 25, 2016
 20 Chicago, Illinois

21
 22 GOLKOW TECHNOLOGIES, INC.
 23 877.370.3377 ph | 917.591.5672 fax
 24 deps@golkow.com

Kimberly Kenton, M.D.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

The deposition of KIMBERLY KENTON, M.D., called by the Plaintiffs for examination, taken pursuant to the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure of the United States District Courts pertaining to the taking of depositions, taken before CORINNE T. MARUT, C.S.R. No. 84-1968, Registered Professional Reporter and a Certified Shorthand Reporter of the State of Illinois, at the offices of Drinker Biddle & Reath LLP, Suite 3700, 191 North Wacker Drive, Chicago, Illinois, on March 25, 2016, commencing at 1:51 p.m.

Kimberly Kenton, M.D.

1 APPEARANCES:

2 ON BEHALF OF THE PLAINTIFFS:

3 MOTLEY RICE LLC

321 South Main Street

4 Providence, Rhode Island 02903

401-457-7728

5 BY: FIDELMA L. FITZPATRICK, ESQUIRE

ffitzpatrick@motleyrice.com

6

7 ON BEHALF OF PLAINTIFF KAREN BOLLINGER:

(via telephonic communication)

8

FREESE & GOSS, PLLC

9 1520 North State Street

Jackson, Mississippi 39202

10 601-961-4050

BY: SHEILA M. BOSSIER, ESQUIRE

11 SBossier@freeseandgoss.com

12

13 ON BEHALF OF THE DEFENDANTS:

14 BUTLER SNOW LLP

1020 Highland Colony Parkway, Suite 1400

15 Ridgeland, Mississippi 39157

601-985-4596

16 BY: PAUL S. ROSENBLATT, ESQUIRE

Paul.Rosenblatt@butlersnow.com

17

18

19 ALSO PRESENT:

20 LAURA HOLCOMB, Senior Paralegal,

Motley Rice LLC

21

22

23

24 REPORTED BY: CORINNE T. MARUT, C.S.R. No. 84-1968

Kimberly Kenton, M.D.

1 A. Yes. Sorry. Yes, if I recall.

2 Q. We don't have you on video today. I
3 just have to wait until you give an affirmative
4 answer.

5 A. Yeah, I apologize.

6 Q. Now, you use the retropubic device in
7 the majority of your patients instead of the
8 transobturator procedure, correct?

9 A. I do.

10 Q. And why is that?

11 A. Several reasons, the first being I think
12 that when you look -- although the long-term
13 outcome data, you can't declare them equivalent or
14 not equivalent in our own study, there was a
15 slightly higher cure of stress incontinence with
16 the retropubic.

17 And I think that that's consistent with
18 what we understand, what we think we understand
19 about incontinence procedures is the more
20 obstructive they are, the more likely they are to
21 cure stress incontinence and possibly induce a
22 little bit more urgency. So...

23 Q. Is there any other reason that you use
24 the retropubic over the transobturator?

Kimberly Kenton, M.D.

1 want to know if you're aware of anything. I think
2 what you're telling me is you don't know of any
3 studies that have been done like that and you don't
4 know how such a study would even be conducted. Is
5 that fair enough?

6 MR. ROSENBLATT: Object to form.

7 BY THE WITNESS:

8 A. I wouldn't know how to conduct that
9 study.

10 BY MS. FITZPATRICK:

11 Q. Okay. Do you know of any clinical
12 trials that have been done to assess specifically
13 the safety of the TVT-O device made by Ethicon?

14 A. So, a clinical trial by definition is
15 comparative. You can't really do a randomized
16 controlled trial to look at safety because,
17 fortunately, most of these complications are rare.
18 So, most of the clinical trials are designed to
19 look at efficacy with safety endpoints.

20 And then it brings us to the systematic
21 reviews and the meta-analyses where we use,
22 fortunately, validated outcome measures that we can
23 try to compile those to more objectively look at
24 safety.

Kimberly Kenton, M.D.

1 rare?

2 A. Sure. I mean, I'm not sure I walk
3 around with a clear cutoff of what rare is.

4 Q. Okay. But somewhere in that
5 neighborhood?

6 A. Yeah.

7 Q. Okay. You know, though, that there are
8 complications that are unique to the helical
9 trocars that are used with the TVT-O versus the
10 trocars that are used with the TVT Retropubic,
11 correct?

12 A. So, can we just like upfront -- I think
13 that there are unique complications associated with
14 the transobturator route of sling placement that
15 differ from the retropubic. I don't know if it's
16 from the trocar or the sling or if I just took a
17 surgical instrument and put it through that space
18 it would be different. Do you understand the
19 difference in those?

20 Q. Okay.

21 A. Let's just like so we don't have to keep
22 going back to that thing. I think that there are
23 differences in complications with the two
24 procedures, whether it's the trocar, whether it's

Kimberly Kenton, M.D.

1 the method of passage.

2 I mean, I could theoretically say that I
3 could just take a surgical instrument and still
4 pass it like how we used to with old-fashioned
5 retropubic slings. That's exactly how we pass the
6 TVT. It's not that different.

7 If I took a uterine packing forceps and
8 pass it through the transobturator space, I think
9 we would see similar complications that are unique
10 to passing something through the transobturator
11 space.

12 Q. Okay. So, let's --

13 A. It's the route of access more than I
14 think it's the device, like that particular trocar.

15 Q. So, with -- just let me see if I have
16 got this right.

17 So, what you're saying with the TV --
18 some of the unique complications, and we can get to
19 what those are, but those unique complications with
20 the obturator procedure, you think are more related
21 to the route of access through the obturator space
22 than the actual trocar itself causing the injury?

23 A. Correct.

24 Q. Is that -- okay.

Kimberly Kenton, M.D.

1 Q. Okay. So, I think that what we had
2 discussed was that --

3 A. I would be retired and not sitting here
4 if I knew how to tension it exactly right for every
5 woman.

6 Q. Okay. And, so, that's something that is
7 inherent in the transobturator midurethral slings
8 as well, the difficulty in getting consistent
9 tensioning from patient to patient to patient to
10 patient, correct?

11 A. Yeah. I think that -- I think -- I
12 think what I meant to say or what I implied or
13 wanted to say was it's not inherent.

14 So, you don't -- you are trying to
15 compensate for a nerve and a muscle that don't
16 work. How sick your nerve and muscle are may be
17 different, if you have incontinence, may be
18 different than how sick mine is.

19 I think that one of the limitations of
20 all continence procedures is how do I decide how to
21 tight to make it for you that you can void freely
22 and not have stress incontinence. It may be
23 different for me.

24 And I think that that's uniform across

Kimberly Kenton, M.D.

1 Q. And the TVT-O is designed by Ethicon to
2 be implanted surgically through the obturator
3 space, correct?

4 A. Correct.

5 Q. And sometimes that surgical placement
6 can cause complications that are unique to the
7 obturator midurethral slings, correct?

8 A. Correct. I can agree with all that.

9 Q. And in addition to the surgical
10 procedure that you use through the obturator space,
11 there is a piece of mesh that's used, correct?

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. And that mesh is left in the obturator
14 space when you're done with your surgery, correct?

15 A. Correct.

16 Q. And that mesh in the whole pelvic
17 region, that can cause certain complications for
18 women, correct?

19 A. Correct.

20 Q. And, so, it seems to me that what this
21 study is suggesting is that the complications that
22 are related to the TVT-O either are related to the
23 surgical route of implantation or the use of mesh.

24 And all I am asking is do you agree with

Kimberly Kenton, M.D.

1 me that those are two different --

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. Okay. Now, are you aware of what
4 technique was used to implant the TVT-O devices
5 that were at issue in Exhibit 6?

6 A. I would have to look back through the
7 paper.

8 Q. So, if you can quickly look through this
9 paper, I would appreciate it, because the surgical
10 technique that was used in this procedure was not
11 the surgical technique that was or that is
12 recommended by J & J/Ethicon, correct?

13 Instead, it's a surgical technique that
14 was modified as originally described by
15 Dr. de Leval?

16 MR. ROSENBLATT: Object to form.

17 BY THE WITNESS:

18 A. No. I would have to -- I mean, I would
19 have to read that and I would have to read the
20 paper.

21 BY MS. FITZPATRICK:

22 Q. This is your paper, right, this is the
23 one that you relied on?

24 A. Well, I read the literature all the

Kimberly Kenton, M.D.

1 fulfilled the promise shown in the short-term and
2 medium-term. Therefore, it is imperative that more
3 careful long-term evaluation of TVT-O techniques is
4 carried out with the focus on complications and
5 durability. Larger studies with longer follow-up
6 periods should identify risk factors for failure
7 and thus lead to better preoperative consultation."

8 Do you see that?

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. Do you agree with that comment?

11 A. So, which part of it? There is like
12 several comments there. Can we just figure out
13 what you want me to agree or disagree?

14 Q. Sure. Do you think it's imperative that
15 more careful long-term evaluation of TVT-O
16 techniques is carried out with the focus on
17 complications and durability?

18 A. I think that, yes, that all
19 obturators -- all surgical procedures in general.

20 Q. Do you believe that for the TVT-O
21 technique specifically that there should be more
22 careful long-term evaluation of its technique with
23 the focus on complications and durability?

24 A. I think that we actually have good

Kimberly Kenton, M.D.

1 medium-term data at about five years. But, yes, we
2 need to follow women for longer periods of time.

3 Q. Okay. And do you agree with this paper
4 that larger studies with longer follow-up periods
5 should identify risk factors for failure and
6 then -- and thus lead to better preoperative
7 consultation?

8 A. I don't think that -- I think it's a
9 nice statement, but I don't think that you're going
10 to get longer studies that are well done with
11 longer term follow-up. I think it's going to have
12 to be systematic reviews and meta-analyses that are
13 trying to compile these things. You can't get
14 women to be in studies for 10, 20 years. It's hard
15 to do.

16 Q. Well, but a systematic review and a
17 meta-analysis isn't going to tell you what the
18 complications are going to look like at 8 or 10 or
19 15 or 20 years, correct?

20 A. Well, they will. When we get cohorts
21 and RCT data out far enough, it will help us with
22 that.

23 Q. So, then what I guess I'm trying to
24 understand is you just told me that it's difficult

Kimberly Kenton, M.D.

1 know which complications. Yeah.

2 Q. If the complication --

3 A. That's what I said.

4 Q. -- was included in Dr. Culligan's paper,
5 it would be included somewhere in Table 3
6 associated with a pubovaginal sling?

7 A. I -- I think so, yes.

8 Q. Okay. Are autologous fascial slings an
9 appropriate alternative to the transobturator --
10 TVT-O transobturator sling?

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. Is the Burch procedure an acceptable
13 appropriate alternative to the TVT-O transobturator
14 sling?

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. And neither of those procedures produces
17 the same rate of groin pain or leg pain as does the
18 TVT-O procedure, correct?

19 A. Correct.

20 MR. ROSENBLATT: Object to form.

21 BY THE WITNESS:

22 A. They have a different type of
23 risk/benefit ratio.

24 BY MS. FITZPATRICK:

Kimberly Kenton, M.D.

1 more --

2 Q. Yeah, I think if you are looking at the
3 adverse events.

4 A. Okay. I am looking at the wrong page.
5 I'm in "Warnings and Precautions."

6 Q. Or "Adverse Reactions."

7 A. Are you in "Warnings and Precautions"?

8 Q. No, I'm on "Adverse Reactions."

9 A. Much smaller list.

10 Q. I will admit some of this is
11 extraordinarily hard to read.

12 A. Much smaller list. "Adverse Reactions."

13 Q. The adverse reactions are the same for
14 the TVT and the TVT-O, correct?

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. So, there is nothing that in those --
17 that "Adverse Reactions" section that can alert the
18 doctor to what you know and have testified about
19 the difference in the risk profiles for these
20 particular products?

21 A. Not in the "Adverse Reactions" portion.
22 They're the same. But there is other information
23 that can alert them.

24 Q. In the IFU? Tell me what's different.

Kimberly Kenton, M.D.

1 A. "Transient leg pain lasting 24 to 48
2 hours." I'm pretty sure that isn't in the
3 retropublic one. I mean, some are common sense.

4 Q. There is nothing in the obturator one
5 about chronic leg pain, correct?

6 A. Not that -- is this -- yeah, there is.

7 Q. One slightly easier.

8 A. Not chronic, no.

9 Q. Chronic, yes. That's what I was asking.
10 There is nothing about --

11 A. Very short time.

12 Q. -- groin pain, but it's the transient
13 one. Okay.

14 Anything else?

15 A. That's the only thing that like popped.
16 Like in this other one they are talking about
17 postoperative restrictions.

18 Q. I think that's in both of them.

19 A. Oh, yeah. It's higher up on the other
20 one.

21 So, it seems that that's the primary
22 difference.

23 Q. So, apart from the reference to the
24 transient leg pain -- hang on. The brains of the